CONSEQUENCES OF MILLENNIALS GENERATION
FINANCIAL LITERACY: A META-ANALYTIC STUDIES

Lilia Pasca Riani¹, Novita Erliana Sari², Efa Wahyuningtyas³
¹Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta, Jln. Colombo, No. 1 Kampus Karangmalang, Depok, Kab. Sleman, DIY
²Universitas PGRI Madiun, Jln. Setia Budi No. 85, Kota Madiun, Jawa Timur
³Universitas Nusantara PGRI Kediri, Jln. KH. Ahmad Dahlan No. 76, Kota Kediri, Jawa Timur

Abstract: During the period from 2030 and 2040, Indonesia will experience a demographic bonus as the population of productive age will make up 60% of the total population. This presents many opportunities for rapid economic growth and development across various economic factors. However, there is a classic problem of unprepared human resources that must be addressed. Public financial literacy remains relatively low, causing many people to make unwise decisions in response to technological advances. While online transactions and financial technology provide convenience, they also have negative consequences, such as debt traps, poor investments, and mismanagement of finances. So this research confirms the results of previous research on the consequences variables of the millennial-generation financial literacy construct. The number of 60 relevant research journals published on various open-access platforms were collected and analyzed using JASP software. The results of this study showed that there were identified 27 consequences variables with Egger’s test showing the absence of publication bias, the Funnel Plot symmetrical test, and the File Safe N test concluded that the meta-analysis research carried out can be scientifically accountable.

Keywords: consequence variable; financial literacy; millennials generation

JEL Classification: G4, J17, M2

A. INTRODUCTION

Indonesia during the period from 2030 to 2040 will receive a demographic bonus (Kominfo, 2020) which is a situation where the Indonesian

*Corresponding Author.
 e-mail: lilia.pasca.riani@uny.ac.id
The population of productive age (15–64 years) will be larger in number than the non-productive age. As for the proportion of 60% of the productive-age population of the total Indonesian population (BPS, 2020).

The demographic bonus can provide an opportunity to boost economic growth and increase the wealth of society. The demographic bonus can lead to increased productivity, as the working-age population is more likely to be productive and contribute to the economy (Ogawa et al., 2005). The demographic bonus can have both potentials and threats to the quality of human resources and the economy in Indonesia. Several conditions must be carried out by Indonesia to maximize the opportunity for the demographic bonus, including increasing employment, household savings, and the high role of women in the labor market. If this potential is utilized, the possibility of achieving the benefits of the demographic bonus is more remarkable. However, uncontrolled child marriage could harm the demographic bonus because it can cause children to drop out of school, thus affecting their quality of life (Risandini & Silvi, 2021).

At 2022, the survey was conducted, the population aged between 15–64 years belonged to the millennial generation category, which is the population born between 1981–1996. Everybody in this generation faces a relatively complex financial experience along with technological advances that facilitate activation, real-time financial traction, and a variety of financial product offerings (Parulian & Tan, 2021). Millennials in Indonesia and around the world face complex financial experiences that can cause stress and anxiety. Many millennials have high levels of debt, particularly in the form of student loans and vehicle loans. This can make it difficult to save for retirement and achieve other financial goals. He increasing wealth gap means that millennials start off with less household income than previous generations. Millennials have lived through multiple financial crises and recessions, which has impacted the way they manage their money. Many millennials still rely on their families for financial support, which can cause feelings of shame and embarrassment so this can make it challenging for millennials to achieve financial independence and manage their finances effectively (Bolognesi et al., 2020; Nugraha, 2018; OJK, 2021). The millennial generation who do not have good financial literacy often face a number of problems in dealing with the rapid development of financial technology. Financial technology, such as payment apps and paid messaging services, can
make it easier to spend without proper planning (Jati et al., 2021). Millennials who lack financial literacy tend to face difficulties in controlling their spending. Millennials who do not master financial literacy may become targets for fraud or online financial data leaks. They need to understand online security practices and how to protect their personal and financial information. The emergence of online shopping applications and targeted advertising can trigger consumerist tendencies. Millennials who do not have good financial literacy may have difficulty resisting the temptation to overspend. Financial technology also opens up new investment opportunities, such as cryptocurrencies or fintech startups. A lack of understanding about this type of investment can cause millennials to miss out on financial growth opportunities. Millennials who lack financial literacy may not have enough emergency funds to deal with financial crises, such as job loss or unexpected health problems (Fitriah et al., 2021; C. M. Gunawan et al., 2023; Saputro & Lestari, 2019; Sutrisno, 2023).

However, behind this convenience, there are also various aspects that must be considered, such as the unpreparedness of the community in utilizing the convenience of financial services to get trapped in debt and failure in managing their personal finances (Halpiah et al., 2021; Muntahanah et al., 2021; Tanan & Dhamayanti, 2020; Yushita, 2017) so that adequate knowledge and abilities regarding financial terminology are needed in many circles of society, which previous research has called financial literacy (Anisah & Crisnata, 2021; Annur, 2022; Brillianti & Kautsar, 2020; Ningtyas, 2019; OJK, 2022) which ultimately leads to various aspects of people’s lives. Therefore, based on the discussion that has been presented, it is very urgent to identify precisely the factors resulting from the financial literacy of the millennial generation and so, based on these considerations, the study aims to confirm the impact of financial literacy on the millennial generation through meta-analysis studies.

B. LITERATURE REVIEW

1. Financial Literacy

Financial literacy is a basic need for society in general to avoid financial problems. Financial literacy occurs when an individual has sufficient knowledge, ability and expertise in managing the resources he possesses to his financial goals.
(Isomidinova et al., 2017; Wulandari, 2019) and in making a business decision related to finance, both family private finance and finance for his business such as about allocating funds to certain posts, determining the size of the debt, planning the purchase of new assets, calculating the investment of property, increasing or increasing its production capacity calculate the costs necessary for the business, calculate material price of the product, and determine the amount of profit cannot easily be done without having a special knowledge about such matters (Ningtyas & Andarsari, 2021; Riani, 2017; Tapokabkab et al., 2022; Wulandari, 2019).

Ansari et al., (2022) and Brillianti & Kautsar, (2020) define the financial literacy of knowledge for finance, further explaining the ability to understand the basic concepts of economics and finance, to how to apply them properly. Financial literacy can also be defined as the ability to use financial knowledge to make decisions. The ability in financial literacy is a process of knowledge to describe the ability of students in understanding and applying concepts related to finance (Lopus et al., 2019; Ningtyas, 2019; Thomas & Subhashree, 2020).

2. Millennial Generation and Its Characteristics

At the time of the demographic bonus, the millennials who are the largest inhabitants of the productive age have played an important role in the development of civilization in Indonesia through its various potential (Badan Pusat Statistik, 2020; Helman, 2021; Kemenppa, 2018; Ningtyas, 2019; Ningtyas & Andarsari, 2021; Parulian & Tan, 2021).

The millennial generation grew up in the strength of the current of technological development (Kemenppa, 2018), they regarded technology as an inseparable lifestyle. The majority of millennials use technology to meet their life needs like searching for information through the Internet. This generation is more interested in information obtained from social media than in the official pages of a body or institution or institution. Familiarity with technology makes it much easier to make online transactions, including a variety of products, whether physical products, financial products, or electronic products, which leads to this generation of millennials to have a consumer lifestyle (Ida et al., 2020; Junita et al., 2021; Ningtyas, 2019; Parulian & Tan, 2021).

Millennials are more consuming in the sense that they are more willing to spend their money on buying a product or using a service based on their
interests, hobbies, and pleasures, not just on their needs, like collecting their favorite colored items even though they are not much needed. According to Sumartono (1998) in Hidayatullah et al., (2018) the concept of consumerism leads to the behaviour of buying goods and services without rational consideration or not on the basis of need.

3. Consequences of Financial Literacy

Factors or variables of impact or consequences of financial literacy constructs that have been studied by many researchers published in journals include financial well-being (Parulian & Tan, 2021; Razen et al., 2020), willingness to take risky investments (Rizaldy Insan Baihaqqy et al., 2020; Susdiani, 2017; Watanapongvanich et al., 2021), financial behavior (Aminatuzzahra’, 2014; Ari Susanti et al., 2017; Brilianti & Lutfi, 2020; de Bassa Scheresberg, 2013; Halilovic et al., 2019; Irwan Fathurrahman et al., 2020; Pradiningtyas & Lukiaastuti, 2019; Razen et al., 2020; Solihat, 2020; Susanti et al., 2017; Yusufina et al., 2022), financial decision making (Anisah & Crisnata, 2021; Calcagno & Monticone, 2015; Djou & Lukiaastuti, 2021; Fong et al., 2021; Hidayatullah et al., 2018; van Rooij et al., 2011; Watanapongvanich et al., 2021), financial resilience (Andira Sucianah & Indrawati Yuhertiana, 2021; Anggita et al., 2020; V. Gunawan et al., 2021), financial satisfaction (Aminatuzzahra’, 2014; Ariani, 2015; A. K. Wardani & Lutfi, 2017; D. K. Wardani & Lestari, 2020), financial self-efficacy (Djou & Lukiaastuti, 2021), entrepreneurship practices (Lopus et al., 2019), Knowledge of financial risk (Santos & Oliveira Tavares, 2020), self-employment (Lopus et al., 2019; Struckell et al., 2022), investment interest (Fong et al., 2021; Putri Afrida & Anita Sari, 2021), financial satisfaction (Siswoyo & Asandimitra, 2021), sustainable SMEs (Jati et al., 2021; Ningtyas & Andarsari, 2021), retirement (Fong et al., 2021; Gallego-Losada et al., 2022).

C. RESEARCH METHODS

This research is a systematic review that synthesizes the results of similar studies. The results of the synthesis are tabulated in such a way as to produce a theoretical model related to the research topic studied, this type of research is
called meta-analysis. Meta-analysis aims to verify the relationship between variables so that the results are in the form of associations or correlations between variables that are included with the range of variants between variables (Wijaya, 2013). This research uses secondary data collected from documentation of similar research results that discuss the antecedents and consequences of millennial generation financial literacy. This research uses data from primary study results that have been published in international databases. The data used in this study are data that meet quantitative criteria or are empirical results. The research population used as a sample source is the results of published research both nationally and internationally that discuss the consequences of millennial generation financial literacy quantitatively. The sampling technique used purposive sampling. Articles were collected through google scholar and researchgate searches from January 2000 to February 2022. It has a clear description of the number of samples (n) and presents data on one of the correlation values (r), t, or F, mean score and standard deviation.

Data analysis in this study uses meta-analysis which aims to examine the constancy of research results caused by variation and verification of research that magnifies variations in research results. Hunter & Schmidt (1990) at (Wijaya et al., 2021) mention, meta-analysis in research is focused on sampling errors and variable measurement errors that often occur in primary studies.

The steps of the measurement error correction meta-analysis are in accordance with the meta-analysis steps carried out by Hunter & Schmidt (1990) at (Wijaya, 2013; Wijaya et al., 2021) and using JASP software:
1. Identifying the number of samples and the value of the correlation coefficient
2. Calculating the effect size of each study
3. Estimating Summary Effect or Mean Effect Size
4. Analysis of Moderator Variables
5. Evaluation of Publication Bias

D. RESULT

Literature relevant has extracted by several criteria. So, the next steps are analysis using JASP Software. Here the result of JASP software to analysis each steps.
1. Number of samples and correlation coefficient

Based on the results of the literature search, these study founds 27 consequent variables of the financial literacy, the following variables are presented in the following table as well as the correlation coefficient value and the number of samples from each study.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Consequence Variable</th>
<th>Coefficient of Correlation</th>
<th>n</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Saving Behavior</td>
<td>0.550</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Shopping Behavior</td>
<td>0.740</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Short-Long term Planning</td>
<td>0.170</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Improvement Productivity</td>
<td>0.360</td>
<td>575</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Entrepreneurship Practices</td>
<td>0.160</td>
<td>575</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Financial Behavior</td>
<td>0.540</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Consumer Behavior</td>
<td>0.780</td>
<td>298</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Risk Profile/Risk Literacy</td>
<td>0.390</td>
<td>408</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Self-Control</td>
<td>0.530</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Behavior of Avoidance and Checking Fees</td>
<td>0.060</td>
<td>309</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Credit Card Behavior</td>
<td>0.360</td>
<td>309</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Financial Well-Being</td>
<td>0.470</td>
<td>309</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Willing to Take Investment Risk</td>
<td>0.010</td>
<td>309</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Financial Goals</td>
<td>0.870</td>
<td>889</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Financial Decision</td>
<td>0.660</td>
<td>889</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Infestation Decision</td>
<td>0.380</td>
<td>400</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Banking Sector Activity</td>
<td>0.510</td>
<td>268</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Financial Satisfaction</td>
<td>0.140</td>
<td>232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Household Financial Resilience</td>
<td>0.390</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Self Employment / Employability</td>
<td>0.820</td>
<td>15069</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>Retirement</td>
<td>0.850</td>
<td>242</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>Economic Knowledge</td>
<td>0.200</td>
<td>700</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>Credit Card Debt</td>
<td>0.670</td>
<td>6573</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>Stock Market Participation</td>
<td>0.770</td>
<td>6573</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>Life Cycle Investment</td>
<td>0.550</td>
<td>6573</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>Household Portofolio</td>
<td>0.430</td>
<td>6573</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>Risk Diversification</td>
<td>0.870</td>
<td>6573</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Correlation coefficient is a number that indicates the degree of closeness of the relationship between variables. The closer the relationship is indicated by a
number close to 1, while the smaller the relationship of a variable, the correlation coefficient is close to zero.

In the table above it appears that there are 14 financial literacy consequence variables with a correlation coefficient above 0.5 which shows a strong correlation between financial literacy variables with consequence variables.

2. Calculating the Effect Size of the Financial Literacy Consequence Variable

Table 2 Effect Size of Financial Literacy Consequence Variable

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Variabel Konsekuensi</th>
<th>Koefisien Korelasi</th>
<th>n</th>
<th>Z</th>
<th>Vz</th>
<th>Sez</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Saving Behavior</td>
<td>0,550</td>
<td>105</td>
<td>0,618</td>
<td>0,010</td>
<td>0,099</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Shopping Behavior</td>
<td>0,740</td>
<td>105</td>
<td>0,950</td>
<td>0,010</td>
<td>0,099</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Short.Long term Planning</td>
<td>0,170</td>
<td>105</td>
<td>0,172</td>
<td>0,010</td>
<td>0,099</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Improvement Productivity</td>
<td>0,360</td>
<td>575</td>
<td>0,377</td>
<td>0,002</td>
<td>0,042</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Entrepreneurship Practices</td>
<td>0,160</td>
<td>575</td>
<td>0,161</td>
<td>0,002</td>
<td>0,042</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Financial Behavior</td>
<td>0,540</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>0,604</td>
<td>0,010</td>
<td>0,102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Consumer Behavior</td>
<td>0,780</td>
<td>298</td>
<td>1,045</td>
<td>0,003</td>
<td>0,058</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Risk Profile / Risk Literacy</td>
<td>0,390</td>
<td>408</td>
<td>0,412</td>
<td>0,002</td>
<td>0,050</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Self-Control</td>
<td>0,530</td>
<td>113</td>
<td>0,590</td>
<td>0,009</td>
<td>0,095</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Behavior of Avoidance and Checking Fees</td>
<td>0,060</td>
<td>309</td>
<td>0,060</td>
<td>0,003</td>
<td>0,057</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Credit Card Behavior</td>
<td>0,360</td>
<td>309</td>
<td>0,377</td>
<td>0,003</td>
<td>0,057</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Financial Well-Being</td>
<td>0,470</td>
<td>309</td>
<td>0,510</td>
<td>0,003</td>
<td>0,057</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Willing to Take Investment Risk</td>
<td>0,010</td>
<td>309</td>
<td>0,010</td>
<td>0,003</td>
<td>0,057</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Financial Goals</td>
<td>0,870</td>
<td>889</td>
<td>1,333</td>
<td>0,001</td>
<td>0,034</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Financial Decision</td>
<td>0,660</td>
<td>889</td>
<td>0,793</td>
<td>0,001</td>
<td>0,034</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Investment Decision</td>
<td>0,380</td>
<td>400</td>
<td>0,400</td>
<td>0,003</td>
<td>0,050</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Banking Sector Activity</td>
<td>0,510</td>
<td>268</td>
<td>0,563</td>
<td>0,004</td>
<td>0,061</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Financial Satisfaction</td>
<td>0,140</td>
<td>232</td>
<td>0,141</td>
<td>0,004</td>
<td>0,066</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Household Financial Resilience</td>
<td>0,390</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>0,412</td>
<td>0,010</td>
<td>0,102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Self Employment / Employability</td>
<td>0,820</td>
<td>15069</td>
<td>1,157</td>
<td>0,000</td>
<td>0,008</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>Retirement</td>
<td>0,850</td>
<td>242</td>
<td>1,256</td>
<td>0,004</td>
<td>0,065</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>Economic Knowledge</td>
<td>0,200</td>
<td>700</td>
<td>0,203</td>
<td>0,001</td>
<td>0,038</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>Credit Card Debt</td>
<td>0,670</td>
<td>6,573</td>
<td>0,811</td>
<td>0,000</td>
<td>0,010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>Stock Market Participation</td>
<td>0,770</td>
<td>6,573</td>
<td>1,020</td>
<td>0,000</td>
<td>0,010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>Life Cycle Investment</td>
<td>0,550</td>
<td>6,573</td>
<td>0,618</td>
<td>0,000</td>
<td>0,010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>Household Portfolio</td>
<td>0,430</td>
<td>6,573</td>
<td>0,460</td>
<td>0,000</td>
<td>0,010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>Risk Diversification</td>
<td>0,870</td>
<td>6,573</td>
<td>1,333</td>
<td>0,000</td>
<td>0,010</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The calculation and analysis of effect sizes in a meta-analytic study enhance the rigor and comprehensiveness of the research, allowing for more meaningful interpretation of the collective evidence across multiple studies.
3. Estimating Summary Effect atau Mean Effect Size

Table 3 Summary Effect/Mean Effect Size Consequence variable Financial Literacy

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Coefficients</th>
<th>Estimate</th>
<th>Standard Error</th>
<th>z</th>
<th>P</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>intercept</td>
<td>0.609</td>
<td>0.076</td>
<td>7.992</td>
<td>&lt; .001</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note. Wald test.

Figure 1 Forest Plot of Financial Literacy consequence variables
The results of the analysis with the Random Effect model show that there is a positive correlation seen from the estimate value with a positive sign (0.609) which is significant between the consequence variables and financial literacy, this is indicated by the value of $z = 7.992; p < 0.001$. The relationship between the consequence variables and Financial Literacy is high (0.609).

A Forest Plot is one of the visual tools used in meta-analysis or other statistical analyzes to present the results of multiple studies or experiments combined. This provides a clear view of the variability of results between different studies and provides an idea of the effects measured. This plot helps see if there is consistency in the results of the studies and provides an estimate of the combined effect of all the studies included in the analysis.

In a Forest Plot, each study is represented by a box or vertical line indicating the confidence interval for the results. This confidence interval can be a 95% confidence interval or another relevant confidence interval depending on the analysis performed. These vertical lines are usually along the point values that represent the effect estimates from each study.

The vertical line crossing the dotted line indicates the 95% confidence interval for the combined effect of all studies combined. If the dotted line (usually red or black) crosses the vertical zero line, it indicates that the effect is not statistically significant. If not, it indicates that the effect is statistically significant.

Forest Plots provide an informative visualization of how the results of individual studies contribute to the combined results and the extent to which the results vary. This helps researchers and readers to better interpret the results of statistical analyzes and meta-analyses. Forest Plots are also used to understand heterogeneity between studies, identify potential bias, and provide a clear picture of the measured effect sizes.

The more right the closer/higher the relationship between financial literacy and the consequent variables. The larger the box indicates significance, the smaller the box indicates insignificance Tails indicate the lower limit and upper limit of each effect size of the antecedent variables analyzed.
Funnel plots are used to identify whether there is publication bias in meta-analyses. Publication bias occurs when studies with statistically significant results are more likely to be published than studies with insignificant results. In a funnel plot, studies should be evenly distributed around a center line, but if there is publication bias, then studies with significant results will tend to be concentrated at the top of the funnel (closer to the effect value) and studies with poor results insignificant will be scattered at the bottom of the funnel.

Funnel Plot results if it shows a symmetrical image, it is stated that the higher the standard error, the more the spread of the effect size. The dots on the Funnel plot show the magnitude of the effect size relationship with the standard error. If the Funnel Plot is symmetrical, then it is evident that there is no publication bias in the meta-analysis study. The Funnel Plot results are difficult to conclude whether the Funnel Plot is symmetrical or not, so the Egger Test is needed to test whether the Funnel Plot is symmetrical or not.
4. Moderating Variable

Moderating variables in a meta-analysis study have important meaning in understanding the variability of results between combined studies. These variables help explain why results from different studies may vary or how the influence of other variables may influence the relationships between the variables being observed in a meta-analysis.

Moderating variables help explain why results from combined studies may vary. In other words, they allow researchers to identify certain factors that moderate or influence the relationships between variables observed in a meta-analysis.

The analysis results show that the 27 effect sizes of the analyzed consequence variables are heterogeneous ($Q = 7,671,281; p < 0.001$). Thus, the Random Effects model is more suitable for estimating the mean effect size of the 27 consequence variables analyzed. The results of the analysis also indicate that there is potential to investigate moderator variables that contribute to influencing the relationship between consequence variables and Financial Literacy.

5. Evaluation of Publication Bias

From the results of Egger’s Test with JASP software, the $p$ value $> 0.05$, namely $p = 0.113$, confirms that the Funnel Plot is symmetrical. Thus it can be concluded that the meta-analysis test conducted does not have publication bias.
The results of the analysis show a Fail-safe N value of 210,081. From this it can be concluded that there are 210,081 similar studies conducted that are not reported or published. The p value < 0.001 indicates that there is no publication bias from the meta-analysis research conducted and the results can be scientifically accounted.

Publication bias is a problem frequently encountered in scientific literature, especially when researchers or journals only publish or accept reports of research results that have statistically significant results. Non-significant results or results indicating that there is no significant effect tend to be unpublished or reported less intensively. This can lead to bias in the scientific literature, where true effects may not be accurately represented.

The results of the analysis using JASP stated that based on the data analyzed, there was no strong or significant evidence indicating that studies that had statistically significant results were treated differently in terms of reporting or publication compared to studies that had insignificant results. This indicates that the analysis did not find significant issues of publication bias in the set of studies analyzed.

**E. DISCUSSION**

The results of this meta-analysis show that financial literacy significantly influences various aspects of people’s lives, especially the millennial generation. Millennials, in this case, include workers, young executives/professionals, homemakers, civil servants, and entrepreneurs who must have financial literacy to achieve their financial goals properly. Defined in the analysis results, there are 27 variables of consequences or impacts caused by financial literacy, namely financial management, including saving behavior, shopping behavior, and short-term and long-term planning both in the family and business scope (V. Gunawan et al., 2021).
Someone with financial knowledge will show healthy saving and spending behavior and mature short- and long-term planning about their finances. Afriani & Yanti (2019) assert that someone with good financial literacy will also show good financial behavior about their ability to avoid financial risks and crimes, especially in online financial transactions. In line with this, research conducted by Jaya & Rathod, (2021), Susanti et al. (2017), Ramadhianisa (2017), Siswanti, (2022) and Ningtya (2019) concluded that a person’s financial literacy will affect his behavior in consumption and achieve financial well-being both in the context of personal financial behavior and business financial management. Financial well-being is a condition where a person or a family has good financial health and feels financially secure. Therefore, someone needs to have financial literacy in order to achieve financial well-being. In this study, millennials who are accustomed to consumerism and hedonism showed a fairly high financial literacy.

They are realizing that good financial behavior will lead to better future conditions. The effect of financial literacy on financial behavior is not limited to gender and marital status. Whether male or female, married or not, financial behavior is determined by the only factor that is knowledge. In today’s global era, many financial advisory companies educate the public on the importance of good financial management.

When associated with the level of investment interest, research from Susdiani (2017), Wardani & Lestari (2020), and Afrida & Sari (2021) results in findings that someone with good financial literacy from various circles of society, such as housewife private employees, and civil servants will tend to be interested in investing, and make decisions to invest in both investments in the money market, capital market, and property because they are aware of the risks and know how to diversify their investment portfolio. The results of this study are corroborated by Basmar et al. (2021), which confirms that since the COVID-19 pandemic, activities in the banking sector have increased along with the increase in the volume of online transactions by people who are starting to understand and use the various facilities provided by banks in online financial transactions.

In the context of household financial resilience, research from Sucianah & Yuhertiana (2021) and Anggita et al. (2020) supports the finding that financial literacy owned by the head of the family or housewife has a significant influence on household financial resilience because they have the awareness to plan
finances well, commit to financial behavior with discipline, and avoid getting into debt for consumptive things. Meanwhile, in the context of business financial resilience, Jati et al., (2021) examined the culinary business in Kupang City, East Nusa Tenggara, during Covid-19 and Ningtyas & Andarsari, (2021) concluded that it is essential for an entrepreneur to have financial literacy because it shows a significant influence on the sustainability of his business.

In terms of financial planning, financial planning is important in achieving a financial goal. In the context of conventional financial planning, it is known as financial freedom, which is synonymous with freedom from work and large passive income. Financial freedom can be obtained when a person has been able to fulfill their various needs only from passive income, such as the results of property investment or business. Financial planning from the perspective of someone with better financial literacy involves a holistic approach to managing one’s financial resources and achieving long-term financial goals. A financially literate person defines clear and specific financial goals, both short-term and long-term. These goals serve as the foundation for their financial planning and decision-making.

Some Indonesians who need an understanding and concept of good and correct financial planning tend to commit waste, resulting in increased poverty. The lack of public knowledge about financial planning, especially in the younger generation, makes the younger generation susceptible to the disease of consumerism, hedonism, and individualism which is concerned with momentary satisfaction and causes prolonged losses. This indicates a weak understanding of financial management. Even most Indonesians still need to apply a family financial budget. Indonesia is ranked as the country where most citizens do not have at least three months’ worth of emergency reserve funds.

Increasingly sophisticated technology and social environment have also increased irrational consumption. Online shopping systems with increasingly creative promotional strategies and the proliferation of shopping centers are some of the factors that make people become increasingly consumptive and make impulsive transactions without careful consideration. People’s decision to buy a product or service is more due to social influence than the needs that should be prioritized. The increase in compulsive buying also affects people’s economic activities.
In terms of financial reports, the results of research from Sularsih & Wibisono (2021) examining the object of research of MSME entrepreneurs in Pasuruan Regency concluded that the existence of financial literacy ownership affects the quality of their financial statements; this means that entrepreneurs who have good financial literacy will be able to make quality financial reports, financial management is carried out efficiently and effectively so as to avoid business bankruptcy. This is also in line with the results of research conducted by Fathurrahman et al. (2020), which examines the financial behavior of MSME entrepreneurs in the Subang Regency area. On the other hand, research from Lopus et al. (2019) and Struckell et al. (2022) shows that someone who has good financial literacy tends to be interested in becoming an independent entrepreneur, hiring themselves in their business and recruiting employees according to the scale of their business. A person with good financial literacy will likely increase their productivity continuously and implement self-employment practices effectively and efficiently.

Financial literacy skills supported by healthy and good financial behaviors and attitudes can help achieve a level of financial well-being effectively. Therefore, financial learning and understanding should be enhanced in special sessions or enrichment courses in schools and universities. Likewise, in the community environment, it can be socialized in the form of workshops/seminars to help people gain knowledge about good financial literacy. Financial education is a lifelong learning, a critical stage when the young generation is in their productive age. It is hoped that this generation will take more time to reflect on financial attitudes and behaviors and increase the absorption of financial literacy properly from various sources available in the era of technology 4.0. Financial literacy can contribute maximally to the community to utilize financial products from banking and other financial institutions as needed, facilitating personal or business financial transactions. Likewise, understanding the risks of each financial product helps people avoid the trap of fraudulent investments, trapped debt, and others.

Related to family financial managers, when family financial managers have much financial experience, there will be much learning gained so that an evaluation can be made from the financial experience. The financial experience that a person has can be used as an evaluation material to manage income and
expenses that have occurred. This means that good financial behavior is partly obtained from positive financial experiences such as controlling spending and saving. The more financial experience a person has, the more they can improve their family’s financial condition in the future. Financial behavior based on good and correct financial experience will create regular and wise management of family financial expenses. Family financial managers have better knowledge, so they will be wiser in controlling expenses such as evaluating, compiling, and making financial budgets. Someone with high financial knowledge will pay attention to future financial planning, such as setting aside money to invest because family financial managers have many opportunities with their financial knowledge to optimize money turnover to get welfare in the future.

Family financial managers with higher financial knowledge also encourage the individual to live a healthy lifestyle, such as living frugally with enough, so that the individual is able to realize what they and their family want. Related to the retirement variable, people who know the basic principles of finance will have a good retirement plan, greater wealth, and better at avoiding consumptive debt. This is because they are able to use money wisely so that it has an impact on increasing economic benefits for themselves. Likewise, in terms of investment, millennials must have sufficient financial literacy in determining the vision, mission, and steps to determine the financial goals to be achieved. With good financial knowledge, individuals can choose various kinds of investment products and weigh which products are profitable.

F. CONCLUSION

This study produced findings that corroborate the results of previous research on financial literacy, especially on the impact caused as a result of whether someone has better financial literacy. The results of this study also strengthen the evidence that a person’s financial literacy can determine various aspects of his life both as an individual and as a business manager. From 60 relevant research journals, 27 consequential variables of millennial generation financial literacy were obtained, covering various groups such as civil servants, private employees, homemakers, MSME entrepreneurs, and students. This generally impacts financial behavior in this case, among others, saving behavior,
consumption behavior, investment interest, how to mitigate various possible risks that will be faced in the future, and thinking or planning about retirement.

Apart from that, the findings of this study also note that the results align with previous research on financial literacy, especially regarding the impacts that arise when someone has better financial literacy. This shows that a better understanding of finances can positively influence various aspects of a person’s life, such as managing personal finances, investing, and managing a business.

This study provides strong evidence that a person’s financial literacy can influence various groups, including civil servants, private employees, homemakers, MSME entrepreneurs, and students. This reflects that financial literacy is relevant for individuals and has significant implications in the context of various professions and social backgrounds.

In addition, these findings highlight the impact of financial literacy on financial behavior, such as wiser savings policies, smarter consumption patterns, interest in investing, and the ability to overcome various financial risks that may be faced in the future. This study reinforces the importance of promoting financial literacy at all levels of society to help individuals and businesses manage their finances better and plan for a more stable future..

G. LIMITATION

The use of limited references in this meta-analysis research, which still needs to include articles indexed by Scopus, may increase the risk of bias in the sample selection of the studies used. The limitations of the data used can influence the quality of analysis and research results. Therefore, future researchers must consider using broader, more multidisciplinary references to produce more comprehensive and reliable research results.

In addition, when searching for references, researchers must pay attention to clear and relevant inclusion criteria to minimize bias in selecting study samples originating from Scopus-indexed published articles or similar. Then, researchers can consider using multiple reference sources that include indexes besides Scopus, such as PubMed, Web of Science, or other scientific databases, to ensure more holistic coverage of studies.
In conducting meta-analysis, attention to the quality and diversity of references is very important to increase the validity of research results and expand understanding of the phenomenon under study.

H. REFERENCES


Badan Pusat Statistik. (2020). *Potret Sensus Penduduk 2020 Menuju Satu Data Kependudukan Indonesia*. https://bps.go.id/publication/download.html?nrbvfeve=MjEzOTk1Yzg4MTQyOGZlZjIwYTE4MjI2&xzmn=aHR0cHM6Ly93d3cuYnBzLmdvLmlkL3B1YmxpY2F0aW9uLzIwMjEvMDEvMjAyMi0wMTYvMTYvMTExNjQzMDctNzQvY29tcGxleS1jb2xvc3QucGltZWNvbnQuaHRtbA%3D%3D&twoadfnoarfeauf=MjAyMi0wMTYvMTYvMTExNjQzMDctNzQvY29tcGxleS1jb2xvc3QucGltZWNvbnQuaHRtbA%3D%3D.


